



STAFF REPORT

TO: Chairman and Members of the Board of Architectural Review
FROM: Department of Community Development
RE: Vineyard Square Discussion
DATE: October 8, 2013

Name: Vineyard Square Location: Southeast corner of N 21st Street and East O Street
Project: N/A Tax Map Number: /35A1/220///3/; /35A1/220///3A;
/35A1/220///4/; /35A1/220///5/
Address: 130-148A N 21st Street &
151 East O Street Loudoun County PIN: 488-37-5267; 488-37-6460; 488-37-
5457; 488-37-7354
Located in the Historic District? No Contributing Structure? N/A
Zoning District: C-4/HC Conformity: N/A

Comments: Discussion of concept design for 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail in Old Town involving demolition of 130-151 N 21st Street.

The application is evaluated under the Purcellville Design Guidelines (Guidelines).

BACKGROUND

Mark Nelis has submitted 3 concept elevations and a site plan for Vineyard Square, a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail in Old Town at the southeast corner of North 21st Street and East O Street. The building would consist of a single-story of retail commercial along approximately half of the North 21st Street frontage before rising to 5 stories (at a height of approximately 59 feet) as it approaches East O Street. Along the East O Street frontage, the building would maintain the same height but add an additional story due to a change in elevation as the site slopes away from North 21st Street (resulting in a height of approximately 69.5 feet). Along the eastern elevation, the building would revert to 5 stories (at a height of approximately 59 feet).

While Vineyard Square’s conceptual design is not yet detailed enough to identify all proposed building materials, staff’s request for more information received this response from James O’Brien of O’Brien & Keane:

We have discussed using a variety of materials that are familiar, authentic and consistent with the heritage of the town. These include native stone, brick, vertical board and batten siding, clapboard siding, and stucco. The specific delineation, articulation, patterns and color have yet to be determined. I hope this is helpful in establishing the character of the project that the clients are hoping to convey.

The remainder of the site would be comprised of parking. A surface lot on the east side of the properties would provide parking for the retail uses and other visitors. Reserved parking for residents of Vineyard Square would be contained on the bottom floor of the building with ingress and egress points on the east side of the building. Both parking areas would be accessed from East O Street.



NOTE: During review, staff discovered a potential discrepancy regarding the overall height of the west (North 21st Street) and east elevations based on the common set of height demarcations provided. The west elevation is shown at a height of approximately 59 feet from street level at North 21st Street which equates to 69 feet from ground level on the east side (due to the change in elevation on the site). The east elevation is shown at a height of approximately 59 feet from ground level on the east side which equates to 49 feet from street level at North 21st Street. This would effectively make the eastern elevation one story shorter than the western elevation; however, the extra story of the west elevation is not displayed in any way on the drawing of the east elevation. It remains to be determined whether this height difference is intentional or an oversight by the applicants.

As currently proposed, Vineyard Square would require the demolition of the buildings containing 130-148A North 21st Street and 151 East O Street as well as their accessory structures. All of the primary buildings and one shed are listed as contributing structures to the Purcellville Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. These buildings are described within the original National Register nomination form thusly:

0130 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information:
Commercial Building, Stories 1.50,
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1920

March 2006: This 1.5-story, shed-roofed commercial building has a stepped parapet that descends towards the rear of the building. The brick façade features a corbelled cornice and pilasters that divide the façade into three storefronts. There are four recessed brick panels above the first story; in the northernmost panel, two windows have been added. The north storefront has a sliding metal door and two low, 8-over-8 windows. The other two storefronts each have a door and a multi-light, fixed-pane display window. The front façade is covered with brick while the other elevations have concrete block walls. Extending from the northeast corner of the building, there is a 2-story, side-gable structure that



Southern half of building from N 21st Street

runs east/west for approximately 100 feet and has a standing-seam metal roof. It has individual storage compartments on both stories with wood siding covering the openings. There is a narrow catwalk along the second story compartments.

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**

Individual Resource Status: **Shed - Non-Contributing**

Individual Resource Status: **Shed - Contributing**



Northern half of building from N 21st Street

0138 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information:
Commercial Building, Stories 1.00,
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1940

November 2005: This 1-story commercial building features a rowlock brick course along the roofline, corbelled bricks below the roofline, and two rectangular inset panels above the storefront. The storefront windows, which consist of plate glass, angle back towards the center to accommodate a recessed entrance door.

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**



Building from N 21st Street

0140 -142 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information:
Commercial Building, Stories 1.00,
Style: Commercial Style, ca 1940

March 2006: This 1-story building features two distinct storefront sections and a wood-shingle mansard-roof. The mansard roof is the result of the 1978 renovation of the building and continues to the building on the north at 144-148 21st Street North (286-5001-0042). The front façade incorporates two distinct sections of three bays each, and a single pedestrian door on the north end of the building. The northernmost section features one 9-pane, fixed window with an adjacent pedestrian doors and one 12-pane, fixed window. The southernmost section of the building has two 12-pane, fixed windows with a single pedestrian door adjacent to the southernmost window. Windows on the front façade have sloping,



Building from N 21st Street
(southern portion; northern portion is 144-148 N 21st Street below)

projecting sills. Windows on the rear façade are 6-over-6, double hung, wood windows. The rear façade incorporates a centered, upper story loading bay and two lower story loading bays, all of which have been in-filled with fenestration and concrete block.

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**

0144 -148 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information: **Commercial Building, Stories 1.00, Style: Commercial Style, 1930**

February 2006: This 1-story building features stuccoed pilasters on the front and north facades and a wood-shingle mansard-roof. The mansard roof is the result of the 1978 renovation of the building and continues to the building on the south. The front façade incorporates two distinct sections of three bays each, the northernmost of which features an inset door with dentils, flanked by a 9-pane, fixed window with sloping sills. The southernmost section of the building has a similar, recessed entrance with a pair of pedestrian doors that are flanked by 12-pane, fixed windows with sloping sills. The doors incorporate 9-lights over 3-lowered panels. The single loading bay at the rear of the building has been in-filled with concrete block, but retains the original wood lintel remains and is inscribed with “Kemp Building 1978.” There is a stuccoed, concrete block, exterior end chimney on the north façade and the majority of fenestration on that façade has been in-filled. Rear windows are a combination of 6-over-6, double hung and 1-over-1, double hung windows.



*Rear (east side) of building
(see above for front side)*

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**

0146 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information: **Blacksmith Shop, Stories 1.50, Style: No Style Listed, ca 1920**

March 2006: This 1.5 story, gable-roof building is constructed of coarse, poured in place concrete. Plywood has been installed on the gable ends. The east and west facades have symmetrical fenestration which includes a single, centered, bay door flanked by two window openings and topped by a loft doorway. The east side window openings



have been in-filled with concrete block, the bay has also been in-filled with a metal, crank, casement window surrounded by concrete block. The west facade window openings have also been in-filled with concrete block, while the bay has been in-filled with aluminum siding punctured by a single pedestrian door and a 1-over-1, double hung, aluminum window. The north façade features a single centered, bay door, flanked by two window openings on each side. The window openings farthest from the bay door have been in-filled with plywood. Windows throughout appear to have poured concrete sills. The concrete block in-fill appears to be circa 1950. A metal stovepipe projects from the west side of the south gable wing. There is also a 1-story, shed-roof addition that runs the full length of the south façade and features a rolling metal door on the west side. The circa 1935 addition is clad in a mix of plywood and seamed metal and sits on a poured concrete foundation, has exposed rafter tails, and is topped by a standing seam metal roof.

Building from East O Street

Individual Resource Status: **Blacksmith Shop - Contributing**

0151 O Street East

Primary Resource Information:
**Commercial Building, Stories 1.00,
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1950**

February 2006: This 1-story, side-gable garage and shop features a centered 1-car garage door with 4 lights, a pedestrian door to the east of the garage door, and one 2-over-2 window on the north and east elevations. There is a metal pipe furnace flue on the southeast corner of the building. The building is covered in corrugated metal siding and the roof is covered in overlapping, grooved metal siding.



Building from East O Street

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**

DEMOLITION DISCUSSION

Because historic structures within the Historic Corridor Overlay Zoning District “cannot be razed, demolished, or moved, in whole or in part, until the razing, demolition or moving is approved by the Board of Architectural Review” (pg.32), the Board should consider and discuss the proposal to demolish the buildings listed above.

The Guidelines state that “there must be a compelling reason to demolish or relocate a significant historic structure” with the Board considering the following criteria:

- a) “The extent to which the removal or relocation of the building or structure would be detrimental to the public interest due its architectural or historic significance.
- b) The extent to which the building or structure is of such old and unusual design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty.
- c) The extent to which retention of the building or structure or group of structures would help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the town.
- d) The extent to which the building or structure or group of structures represents a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.
- e) The extent to which retention of the building or structure would help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood.
- f) The extent to which retention or, in the converse, removal or relocation of the building or structure or group of structures supports goals, objectives or policies of the Town Comprehensive Plan.” (pg.32)

PRELIMINARY DESIGN ANALYSIS

CONTEXT AND COMPATIBILITY

The Guidelines state that “scale, orientation, relationship and character of the built environment make up its context” (pg. 6). This section lays out “rules of thumb” pertaining to conceptualism and compatibility. Subsections (i)-(iii) and (v-vi) are applicable to this development.

- (i) “All new construction and development should incorporate those characteristics of the Town that exhibit a positive distinctive architectural style and/or established functional or landscape patterns.” (pg. 7)

The proposed building would incorporate the Town’s distinctive architectural style through features such as standing seam metal roofS and divided lite windows as well as incorporating materials such as native stone, brick, and vertical board and batten siding.

- (ii) “New buildings and additions should be sited in a manner that will complement rather than conflict with existing adjacent buildings, landscape, streetscape, parking, and access.” (pg. 7)

The proposed building would be sited to form a full block of new buildings along North 21st Street from East O Street to an alley on the south. The building would be built close to the street similar to other buildings in Old Town and only separated by a sidewalk (although a plaza would sit mid-block on North 21st Street). Parking would be located to the rear of the building leading to less conflict with pedestrians.

Vehicular access may be a concern as the building’s density is likely to increase vehicle trips compared to the existing buildings and businesses on the site, and any additional trips would ultimately be routed through North 21st Street which is one-way only for half of its length in Old Town.

- (iii) “Transitions between existing and new buildings or additions should be gradual. The height and mass of new projects or construction should not create abrupt changes from those of existing buildings.” (pg. 7)

The proposed building would vary in height from a single-story (overall height: 24 feet) along parts of North 21st Street to 5 and 6 stories (overall height: 69 feet) for a relatively abrupt change of approximately 45 feet in height within the site itself. Nearby buildings along North 21st Street are primarily 2-2.5 stories with only the Town’s old mills rising above that height. If built, Vineyard Square would likely become the tallest building in town.

- (v) “Buildings should be oriented to connect with high activity areas, such as restaurant dining areas or major pedestrian areas, in order to create connections and linkages.” (pg. 7)

The proposed building is oriented toward its bordering streets and sidewalks which provide the means by which pedestrians travel to Old Town’s restaurants, shops, and offices.

- (vi) “Loading areas, trash and storage areas, and rooftop or other mechanical equipment in particular, should be screened from view from adjacent properties.” (pg. 7)

Although the locations of these areas are not yet certain, the provided elevations appear to meet this goal.

SITE DEVELOPMENT

Street Frontage

The Guidelines “strongly encourag[e] that the front building façade...[and] the predominant major building point of entry shall be oriented toward the major street. (pg. 8)

The primary entrances to the proposed building are oriented toward North 21st Street and East O Street with a lesser number of entrances facing the surface parking lot to the east.

Site Grading

The Guidelines state that “site grading should be sensitive to the existing natural landscape” to “preserve existing trees” and “leveling of the site with severe cut and fill...is strongly discouraged.” (pg. 9)

The concept currently takes advantage of the site’s change in elevation, so there will likely be minimal site grading as part of this project.

Pedestrian Access

“Pedestrian access to the site should be considered equally with vehicular access. Sidewalks and night lighting should be designed to encourage pedestrian traffic.” (pg. 9)

Sidewalks are available to pedestrians around three of the building’s four sides, and these sidewalks are connected to sidewalks in front of the neighboring commercial buildings.

GENERAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

Building Form

The Guidelines state that “new buildings...must be compatible with existing buildings and reflect, but not be required to mimic the architectural styles of the early to mid-twentieth century...[and] respect Purcellville’s historic architectural styles.” (pg. 10)

The architect has stated that the proposed building would utilize “materials that are familiar, authentic and consistent with the heritage of the town.” The elevations propose a range of architectural styles and details; the compatibility of these styles with existing buildings varies.

Façade Articulation

- a) “Long, blank, unarticulated street wall facades without window or door openings are prohibited. Walls should be divided into a series of structural bays.” (pg. 12)

There are no unarticulated walls displayed on the submitted elevations which include a number of structural bays; however, it is unclear what is proposed for the southern façade that would front on the alley.

- b) “Monolithic street wall facades should be “broken” by vertical and horizontal articulation (e.g. sculpted, carved or penetrated wall surfaces) characterized by: (a) breaks (reveals, recesses) in the surface of the wall plane; (b) placement of window and door openings; or (c) placement of balconies, awnings, and canopies.” (pg.12)

Walls are articulated through a mixture of recessed breaks in the wall plane, windows and door openings, balconies, and awnings.

- c) “Large unbroken facade surfaces at the storefront level must be avoided. This can be achieved in a number of ways including: (a) dividing the facade into a series of display windows with smaller panes of glass; (b) constructing the facade with small human scale materials such as brick or decorative tile along bulkheads; (c) providing traditional recessed entries; (d) careful sizing, placement, and overall design of signage; and (e) providing consistent door and window reveals.” (pg. 12)

Façade surfaces at the storefront level are broken by use of recessed entries and display windows. Some of the windows utilize actual or simulated smaller panes of glass while others do not.

Storefront Design

- b) “Commercial storefronts and entries are typically recessed and/or sheltered by a covered arcade structure, canopy or awning. This can provide additional display area, a sheltered transition to the interior of the store and emphasizes the entrance. Recessed entries should be retained and are strongly encouraged in new storefront construction.” (pg. 14)

It appears that some entries are recessed, but greater detail would be necessary to determine the extent to which this is true throughout the building.

- d) “Façade Color: Color preferences are very subjective. The intent of these design guidelines is not to limit creativity or personality but to provide guidance to the types of colors that are both respectful and complimentary to the architecture as well as the Town. The use of light, subdued or neutral colors and natural building materials, such as brick, wood or stone is encouraged.” (pg. 14)

The façade would consist primarily of “light, subdued or neutral colors” although these would represent colors ranging from red to green to blue to brown to tan.

- e) “A visually interesting streetscape with varied but compatible colors and materials is the desired objective of the Design Guidelines. Property owners are encouraged to paint their structure a field and trim color that is complimentary to the adjacent property.” (pg.15)

The predominant trim color is white while there are numerous field colors proposed. At this time, it is difficult to determine how well they would compliment adjacent property without further detail regarding materials.

- f) “One base color should be used for the entire facade. Different trim colors are encouraged however these guidelines recommend limiting façade trim colors to a maximum of three different colors.” (pg.15)

More than one base color is proposed for the façade as the building attempts to appear as if it consists of multiple buildings. Only one color of trim is proposed.

- h) “Primary colors on façade exteriors is inconsistent with the character encouraged by these design guidelines and should be considered with caution.” (pg.15)

It does not appear that any primary colors are proposed.

Windows

“Aesthetically, a building with plenty of window area coupled with articulations such as shutters, holdbacks, substantial window cornices and sills is far more inviting and provides a sense of quality and permanence. As a general rule, businesses with generous amounts a glass area tend to be visible and potentially more successful than businesses that are less visible from the street and present a “closed-in” appearance.” (pg. 15)

The proposed building contains significant window area for the three elevations provided.

Doors

- b) “Wood doors with wood storefront windows are preferable to aluminum systems. If aluminum systems are absolutely necessary, a pre-finished color (compatible with the approved color scheme) is preferred. Mill finish aluminum or dark bronze finish is strongly discouraged.” (pg. 17)

Unable to evaluate without greater detail being provided.

- c) “Retail shop doors should contain a high percentage of glass.” (pg. 17)

The doors to retail areas would contain a high percentage of glass.

- e) “Use of clear glass on the first floor is strongly recommended.” (pg. 17)

It appears that all glass used on the building would be clear.

Roofs

- a) “Roofs may be flat or sloped and consistent with the surrounding buildings. Attention should be given to the incorporation of decorative parapets and meaningful cornice lines (e.g. Valley Energy Building).” (pg. 17)

The building would primarily consist of flat roofs with limited use of sloped standing seam metal roofs.

- b) “Several of the more appropriate building designs in Town exhibit full roofs with the gable ends facing the primary street. The visible portion of sloped roofs should be sheathed with a roofing material complementary to the architectural style of the building and other surrounding buildings.” (pg. 17)

The building would make only minor use of gables as the majority of the roof would be flat. The visible portion of the sloped roofs would be sheathed in standing seam metal panels.

- e) “Low pitched exposed roofs with a slope of 5:12 or shallower is not in keeping with the towns vernacular and strongly discouraged.” (pg. 17)

Unable to evaluate without greater detail being provided.

Building Materials

The Guidelines state that “whenever possible, it is desired that time honored materials, present at the beginning of the twentieth century, are used in order to further the historic charm of the town. Natural materials age more gracefully and hold up better over time than many of the newer products.” (pg. 18)

The architect has stated that the proposed building would utilize “materials that are familiar, authentic and consistent with the heritage of the town;” however, material selection has not been finalized.

Awnings and Canopies

- a) “Awnings are encouraged and should be a single color or two-color stripes. Lettering and trim, utilizing other colors is allowed in the valance area and will be considered signage. All awning signage must comply with the Town’s Zoning Regulations.” (pg. 20)

Awnings of various styles are proposed throughout the building.

- b) “Awning shape should relate to the window or door opening and be sympathetic to the building design. Barrel shaped awnings should be used to complement arched windows while rectangular awnings should be used on rectangular windows.” (pg. 20)

The proposed awnings would be rectangular and either sloped or flat (perpendicular to the wall surface).

Rear Entrances

- a) “Rear entries should be treated architecturally and compatible with the overall building design.” (pg. 21)

The rear entries are similar to doors facing North 21st Street and East O Street. .