



STAFF REPORT

TO: Chairman and Members of the Board of Architectural Review
FROM: Department of Community Development
RE: CDA13-22 151 East O Street Demolition
DATE: November 15, 2013

| | | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|---|
| Name: | <u>151 East O Street</u> | Location: | <u>Eastern edge of N 21st Street in Old Town</u> |
| Project: | <u>N/A</u> | Tax Map Number: | <u>/35A1/220///3/</u> |
| Address: | <u>151 East O Street</u> | Loudoun County PIN: | <u>488-37-5267</u> |
| Located in the Historic District? | <u>Yes</u> | Contributing Structure? | <u>Yes</u> |
| Zoning District: | <u>C-4/HC</u> | DHR ID: | <u>286-5001-0547</u> |

Comments: Application to demolish 151 East O Street in anticipation of the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11) a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building.

The application is evaluated under the Demolition Permit Criteria of the Historic Corridor Overlay District (see Article 14A, Section 8.3 in the Zoning Ordinance) and the Purcellville Design Guidelines (Guidelines).

BACKGROUND

Chapman Group, LLC has submitted an application to demolish 151 East O Street; this building sits to the east of the commercial buildings on North 21st Street. This demolition is sought as a precursor to the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11), a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail. The 0.569 acre parcel containing this building also contains 3 other buildings for which demolition approval is sought (CDA13-19 through CDA13-21).



This building is listed as a structure contributing to the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The building is described within the original National Register nomination form thusly:

0151 O Street East

Primary Resource Information:

**Commercial Building, Stories 1.00,
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1950**

February 2006: This 1-story, side-gable garage and shop features a centered 1-car garage door with 4 lights, a pedestrian door to the east of the garage door, and one 2-over-2 window on the north and east elevations. There is a metal pipe furnace flue on the southeast corner of the building. The building is covered in corrugated metal siding and the roof is covered in overlapping, grooved metal siding.



Building from East O Street

Individual Resource Status: **Commercial Building - Contributing**

ANALYSIS

ZONING ORDINANCE

Per Article 14A, Section 2.3 of the Zoning Ordinance, no building within the Historic Corridor Overlay Zoning District “shall be... demolished, in whole or in part, unless and until a certificate of design approval authorizing such work shall have been approved in accordance with this article.” Section 8.3 of Article 14A provides the following criteria to be considered by the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) in reviewing demolition applications:

- (1) “The designation of the particular structure as historic or non-historic by a qualified historic preservation professional or by a government-recognized historic survey;”

This building is listed as a contributing structure for the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places; however, the building is not individually listed as historic on any government historic survey.

- (2) “The context of the structure in relation to surrounding buildings and landscape on the site and adjacent and nearby sites; and”

This building is located in Old Town behind buildings constructed in the early to mid-1900s which line North 21st Street. These buildings are constructed from a range of materials and are generally 1-2.5 stories in height. The land to the east of 21st slopes away from the road.

- (3) “The appropriateness, as determined through application of applicable design criteria and guidelines, of proposed structures, which will replace the demolished structure, if any.”

See CDA13-11 Vineyard Square staff report.

GUIDELINES

The Guidelines provide the following guidance: “The Town Comprehensive Plan supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources to the greatest extent possible. Thus, the Board seeks to retain the existing historic fabric of the Town, while balancing the needs of property owners to make contemporary use of their property.” (pg. 31) The Guidelines authorize the Town Zoning Administrator to determine when a building has historic significance based upon certain criteria which automatically designate this building as historically significant.

The Guidelines state that “there must be a compelling reason to demolish or relocate a significant historic structure” with the Board considering the following criteria:

- a) “The extent to which the removal or relocation of the building or structure would be detrimental to the public interest due its architectural or historic significance.” (pg.32)

This building has no particular architectural or historic significance.

- b) “The extent to which the building or structure is of such old and unusual design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty.” (pg.32)

This building is constructed of wood and metal. These materials could be reproduced easily, and the building’s design is not particularly unusual.

- c) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure or group of structures would help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the town.” (pg.32)

This building’s date of construction is consistent with nearby buildings in Old Town; however, there is little else about this building that is distinctive.

- d) “The extent to which the building or structure or group of structures represents a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.” (pg.32)

This building does not represent unique or rare examples of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.

- e) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure would help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood.” (pg.32)

This building is located behind the buildings along North 21st Street and does not contribute to the scale and character of the neighborhood.

- f) “The extent to which retention or, in the converse, removal or relocation of the building or structure or group of structures supports goals, objectives or policies of the Town Comprehensive Plan.” (pg.32)

As stated previously, the 2006 Town Comprehensive Plan strongly supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources; however, the 2005 Purcellville Downtown Master Plan considered the area east of 21st Street as a district that offered dramatic opportunity for infill development compatible with other downtown development.

FINDINGS

- 1) The criteria of the Guidelines automatically designate the building as historically significant; the Zoning Administrator would otherwise determine that this building is not historically significant.
- 2) Excluding age, there are no distinctive or unusual features of this building that would make it architecturally or historically significant and warrant its preservation.

ACTION:

One of following sample motions should be used:

I move that the BAR approve CDA13-22 151 East O Street Demolition as presented.

-Or-

I move that the BAR approve CDA13-22 151 East O Street Demolition with the following required conditions:

- A.
- B.
- C.

And/or the following recommendations:

- A.
- B.

-Or-

I move that the BAR not approve CDA13-22 151 East O Street Demolition for the following reasons:

- A.
- B.
- C.