



STAFF REPORT

TO: Chairman and Members of the Board of Architectural Review
FROM: Department of Community Development
RE: CDA13-21 146 North 21st Street Demolition
DATE: November 15, 2013

Name: 146 North 21st Street Location: Eastern edge of N 21st Street in Old Town
Project: N/A Tax Map Number: /35A1/220///3/
Address: 146 North 21st Street Loudoun County PIN: 488-37-5267
Located in the Historic District? Yes Contributing Structure? Yes
Zoning District: C-4/HC DHR ID: 286-5001-0578

Application to demolish 146 North 21st Street in anticipation of the construction of Vineyard Square
Comments: (CDA13-11) a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building.

The application is evaluated under the Demolition Permit Criteria of the Historic Corridor Overlay District (see Article 14A, Section 8.3 in the Zoning Ordinance) and the Purcellville Design Guidelines (Guidelines).

BACKGROUND

Chapman Group, LLC has submitted an application to demolish 146 North 21st Street; this building sits to the east of the commercial buildings on North 21st Street. This demolition is sought as a precursor to the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11), a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail. The 0.569 acre parcel containing this building also contains 3 other buildings for which demolition approval is sought (CDA13-19 through CDA13-20 & CDA13-22).



This building is listed as a structure contributing to the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The building is described within the original National Register nomination form thusly:

0146 21st Street North

Primary Resource Information:

**Blacksmith Shop, Stories 1.50,
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1920**

March 2006: This 1.5 story, gable-roof building is constructed of coarse, poured in place concrete. Plywood has been installed on the gable ends. The east and west facades have symmetrical fenestration which includes a single, centered, bay door flanked by two window openings and topped by a loft doorway. The east side window openings have been in-filled with concrete block, the bay has also been in-filled with a metal, crank, casement window surrounded by concrete block. The west facade window openings have also been in-filled with concrete block, while the bay has been in-filled with aluminum siding punctured by a single pedestrian door and a 1-over-1, double hung, aluminum window. The north façade features a single centered, bay door, flanked by two window openings on each side. The window openings farthest from the bay door have been in-filled with plywood. Windows throughout appear to have poured concrete sills. The concrete block in-fill appears to be circa 1950. A metal stovepipe projects from the west side of the south gable wing. There is also a 1-story, shed-roof addition that runs the full length of the south façade and features a rolling metal door on the west side. The circa 1935 addition is clad in a mix of plywood and seamed metal and sits on a poured concrete foundation, has exposed rafter tails, and is topped by a standing seam metal roof.



Building from East O Street

Individual Resource Status: **Blacksmith**

Shop - Contributing

ANALYSIS

ZONING ORDINANCE

Per Article 14A, Section 2.3 of the Zoning Ordinance, no building within the Historic Corridor Overlay Zoning District “shall be... demolished, in whole or in part, unless and until a certificate of design approval authorizing such work shall have been approved in accordance with this article.” Section 8.3 of Article 14A provides the following criteria to be considered by the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) in reviewing demolition applications:

- (1) “The designation of the particular structure as historic or non-historic by a qualified historic preservation professional or by a government-recognized historic survey;”

This building is listed as a contributing structure for the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places; however, the building is not individually listed as historic on any government historic survey.

- (2) “The context of the structure in relation to surrounding buildings and landscape on the site and adjacent and nearby sites; and”

This building is located in Old Town behind buildings constructed in the early to mid-1900s which line North 21st Street. These buildings are constructed from a range of materials and are generally 1-2.5 stories in height. The land to the east of 21st slopes away from the road.

- (3) “The appropriateness, as determined through application of applicable design criteria and guidelines, of proposed structures, which will replace the demolished structure, if any.”

See CDA13-11 Vineyard Square staff report.

GUIDELINES

The Guidelines provide the following guidance: “The Town Comprehensive Plan supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources to the greatest extent possible. Thus, the Board seeks to retain the existing historic fabric of the Town, while balancing the needs of property owners to make contemporary use of their property.” (pg. 31) The Guidelines authorize the Town Zoning Administrator to determine when a building has historic significance based upon certain criteria which automatically designate this building as historically significant.

The Guidelines state that “there must be a compelling reason to demolish or relocate a significant historic structure” with the Board considering the following criteria:

- a) “The extent to which the removal or relocation of the building or structure would be detrimental to the public interest due its architectural or historic significance.” (pg.32)

This building has no particular architectural or historic significance.

- b) “The extent to which the building or structure is of such old and unusual design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty.” (pg.32)

This building is constructed of poured in place concrete, concrete block, plywood, and seamed metal. All of these materials could be reproduced easily, and the building’s design is not particularly unusual.

- c) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure or group of structures would help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the town.” (pg.32)

This building’s date of construction is consistent with nearby buildings in Old Town; however, there is little else about this building that is distinctive.

- d) “The extent to which the building or structure or group of structures represents a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.” (pg.32)

This building does not represent unique or rare examples of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.

- e) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure would help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood.” (pg.32)

This building is located behind the buildings along North 21st Street and does not contribute to the scale and character of the neighborhood.

- f) “The extent to which retention or, in the converse, removal or relocation of the building or structure or group of structures supports goals, objectives or policies of the Town Comprehensive Plan.” (pg.32)

As stated previously, the 2006 Town Comprehensive Plan strongly supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources; however, the 2005 Purcellville Downtown Master Plan considered the area east of 21st Street as a district that offered dramatic opportunity for infill development compatible with other downtown development.

FINDINGS

- 1) The criteria of the Guidelines automatically designate the building as historically significant; the Zoning Administrator would otherwise determine that this building is not historically significant.
- 2) Excluding age, there are no distinctive or unusual features of this building that would make it architecturally or historically significant and warrant its preservation.

ACTION:

One of following sample motions should be used:

I move that the BAR approve CDA13-21 146 North 21st Street Demolition as presented.

-Or-

I move that the BAR approve CDA13-21 146 North 21st Street Demolition with the following required conditions:

- A.
- B.
- C.

And/or the following recommendations:

- A.
- B.

-Or-

I move that the BAR not approve CDA13-21 146 North 21st Street Demolition for the following reasons:

- A.
- B.
- C.