



**STAFF REPORT**

**TO:** Chairman and Members of the Board of Architectural Review  
**FROM:** Department of Community Development  
**RE:** CDA13-12 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street – Main Building Demolition  
**DATE:** November 15, 2013

---

Name: 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Main Building Location: Eastern edge of N 21<sup>st</sup> Street in Old Town  
Project: N/A Tax Map Number: /35A1/220///5/  
Address: 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Loudoun County PIN: 488-37-7354  
Located in the Historic District? Yes Contributing Structure? Yes  
Zoning District: C-4/HC DHR ID: 286-5001-0037

Comments: Application to demolish the main building at 130 North 21st Street in anticipation of the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11) a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building.

---

The application is evaluated under the Demolition Permit Criteria of the Historic Corridor Overlay District (see Article 14A, Section 8.3 in the Zoning Ordinance) and the Purcellville Design Guidelines (Guidelines).

**BACKGROUND**

Martinsburg Plaza, LLC has submitted an application to demolish the main commercial building at 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street; this building has street frontage on North 21<sup>st</sup> Street. This demolition is sought as a precursor to the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11), a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail. The 1.23 acre parcel containing this building also contains 6 other buildings for which demolition approval is sought (CDA13-13 through CDA 13-17).



The main commercial building is listed as a structure contributing to the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The building is described within the original National Register nomination form thusly:

**0130 21st Street North**

*Primary Resource Information:*

**Commercial Building, Stories 1.50,  
Style: No Style Listed, ca 1920**

March 2006: This 1.5-story, shed-roofed commercial building has a stepped parapet that descends towards the rear of the building. The brick façade features a corbelled cornice and pilasters that divide the façade into three storefronts. There are four recessed brick panels above the first story; in the northernmost panel, two windows have been added. The north storefront has a sliding metal door and two low, 8-over-8 windows. The other two storefronts each have a door and a multi-light, fixed-pane display window. The front façade is covered with brick while the other elevations have concrete block walls. Extending from the northeast corner of the building, there is a 2-story, side-gable structure that runs east/west for approximately 100 feet and has a standing-seam metal roof. It has individual storage compartments on both stories with wood siding covering the openings. There is a narrow catwalk along the second story compartments.

*Individual Resource Status:* **Commercial Building - Contributing**



*Southern half of building from N 21<sup>st</sup> Street*



*Northern half of building from N 21<sup>st</sup> Street*

**ANALYSIS**

**ZONING ORDINANCE**

Per Article 14A, Section 2.3 of the Zoning Ordinance, no building within the Historic Corridor Overlay Zoning District “shall be... demolished, in whole or in part, unless and until a certificate of design approval authorizing such work shall have been approved in accordance with this article.” Section 8.3 of Article 14A provides the following criteria to be considered by the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) in reviewing demolition applications:

- (1) “The designation of the particular structure as historic or non-historic by a qualified historic preservation professional or by a government-recognized historic survey;”

*This building is listed as a contributing structure for the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places; however, the building is not individually listed as historic on any government historic survey.*

- (2) “The context of the structure in relation to surrounding buildings and landscape on the site and adjacent and nearby sites; and”

*This building is located in Old Town amidst other buildings constructed in the early to mid-1900s which line North 21<sup>st</sup> Street. These buildings are constructed from a range of materials and are generally 1-2.5 stories in height. The land to the east of 21<sup>st</sup> slopes away from the road.*

- (3) “The appropriateness, as determined through application of applicable design criteria and guidelines, of proposed structures, which will replace the demolished structure, if any.”

*See CDA13-11 Vineyard Square staff report.*

## **GUIDELINES**

The Guidelines provide the following guidance: “The Town Comprehensive Plan supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources to the greatest extent possible. Thus, the Board seeks to retain the existing historic fabric of the Town, while balancing the needs of property owners to make contemporary use of their property.” (pg. 31) The Guidelines authorize the Town Zoning Administrator to determine when a building has historic significance based upon certain criteria which automatically designate this building as historically significant.

The Guidelines state that “there must be a compelling reason to demolish or relocate a significant historic structure” with the Board considering the following criteria:

- a) “The extent to which the removal or relocation of the building or structure would be detrimental to the public interest due its architectural or historic significance.” (pg.32)

*This building has no particular architectural or historic significance.*

- b) “The extent to which the building or structure is of such old and unusual design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty.” (pg.32)

*This building is constructed of brick, concrete block, wood siding, and metal panels. All of these materials could be reproduced easily, and the building’s design is not particularly unusual.*

- c) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure or group of structures would help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the town.” (pg.32)

*This building’s date of construction is consistent with nearby buildings in Old Town; however, there is little else about this building that is distinctive.*

- d) “The extent to which the building or structure or group of structures represents a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.” (pg.32)

*This building does not represent a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.*

- e) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure would help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood.” (pg.32)

*This building has a similar scale and character to other buildings along North 21<sup>st</sup> Street, but a newly constructed building could easily serve the same purposes.*

- f) “The extent to which retention or, in the converse, removal or relocation of the building or structure or group of structures supports goals, objectives or policies of the Town Comprehensive Plan.” (pg.32)

*As stated previously, the 2006 Town Comprehensive Plan strongly supports the preservation of the town's historic resources, yet the façade of the northern half of 130 N 21<sup>st</sup> Street was specifically noted as a substandard façade needing improvement in the 2005 Purcellville Downtown Master Plan.*

**FINDINGS**

- 1) The criteria of the Guidelines automatically designate this building as historically significant; the Zoning Administrator would otherwise determine that this building is not historically significant.
- 2) Excluding age, there are no distinctive or unusual features of this building that would make it architecturally or historically significant and warrant its preservation.

**ACTION:**

One of following sample motions should be used:

*I move that the BAR approve CDA13-12 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Main Building Demolition as presented.*

*-Or-*

*I move that the BAR approve CDA13-12 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Main Building Demolition with the following required conditions:*

- A.
- B.
- C.

*And/or the following recommendations:*

- A.
- B.

*-Or-*

*I move that the BAR not approve CDA13-12 130 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Main Building Demolition for the following reasons:*

- A.
- B.
- C.